



Lower Russian River Municipal Advisory Council

In accordance with Executive Order AB361 regarding the Brown Act for public meetings during the public health emergency, the River MAC meeting will be held virtually. The meeting will be on Zoom and on Facebook live, links below. After the event, videos are available both on facebook and on Youtube. YouTube Channel can be found under Sonoma County 5th District.

Please click the link below to join the webinar:

Please click the link below to join the webinar:

<https://sonomacounty.zoom.us/j/92511241288?pwd=ZXFWY3g4T1Y4MzcyZEhvNGI3bTRHdz09>

Passcode: 584049

Or One tap mobile :

US: +16694449171,,92511241288# or +16699009128,,92511241288#

Streaming Facebook Live on Supervisor Lynda Hopkins' page

<https://www.facebook.com/supervisorlyndahopkins/>

Agenda

October 20, 2022

5:30 – 7:30 pm

The Lower Russian River Municipal Advisory Council welcomes you to its meeting. Your interest and participation are encouraged and appreciated. Questions and comments may be entered in the zoom Q&A.

Call to Order Clerk Debbie Ramirez

Pledge of Allegiance Chair

Roll Call Chair

Approval of Agenda Chair Pip Marquez de la Plata

Statement of Conflict of Interest: This is the time for the Chair, Vice Chair and Councilmembers to indicate any statements of conflict of interest for any item listed on this agenda.

Correspondence

Consent Calendar August 2022 minutes

Council Member Comment: on Matters not listed on the Agenda: Comments are restricted to matters within the Board's jurisdiction. Please be brief and limit spoken comments to one minute.

Public Comment: on Matters not listed on the Agenda: Comments are restricted to matters within the Board's jurisdiction. Please be brief and limit spoken comments to two minutes.

Regular Calendar Items

- **Supervisor Lynda Hopkins**
- **Happy Arts Presentation**
 - Presentation by Kristen Madsen with Creative Sonoma
- **Trash Ad Hoc Committee Report**
 - Lisa Nahmanson / Carol Shumate
- **Presentation by Gary Helfrich from Permit Sonoma regarding implementation of the 2022 Vacation Rental Ordinance**
- **Community input planning process for Lower Russian River R1 Resort Area inclusion Zone**

Committee/Staff/Council member reports

- Staff Report on (s)Election process

Documents related to open session agendas:

Any writings or documents provided to a majority of the Lower Russian River Municipal Advisory Council regarding any item on this agenda after the posting of this agenda and not otherwise exempt from disclosure will be made available for public review at 575 Administration Drive, Room 100-A, Santa Rosa, CA, during normal business hours.

Disability Accommodations:

The Lower Russian River Municipal Advisory Council will make reasonable accommodations for persons having special needs due to disabilities. Please contact the Fifth District Field Representative at 707-565-2866 during regular business hours at least 48 hours prior to the meeting to ensure necessary accommodations are made.

River MAC

Please visit the Lower Russian River MAC pages on the County website for agendas, including meeting location and time:
<https://sonomacounty.ca.gov/administrative-support-and-fiscal-services/board-of-supervisors/boards-commissions-committees-and-task-forces/list-of-boards-commissions-committees-and-task-forces/lower-russian-river-municipal-advisory>



Lower Russian River Municipal Advisory Council DRAFT Minutes

August 18th, 2022

5:30-7:30PM

Video recording: <https://youtu.be/4pQ7L8gz1Wl>

Call to order: Chair Pip Marquez de la Plata

Pledge of Allegiance by Vesta Copestakes

Roll call: Clerk Jeanne Broome

Present: Vesta Copestakes, Lisa Nahmanson, Alice Teeter, Pip Marquez de la Plata, Naomi Huffstutter, Nic Pereira, Kyra Wink, Tony Goodwin

Approval of the agenda Chair Pip Marquez de la Plata

Motion to approve by Lisa Nahmanson, second by Vesta Copestakes

Motion passes unanimously in roll call vote

Statement of Conflict of Interest: n/a

Correspondence: n/a

Consent Calendar:

Pip: Apologies on missing minutes from last meeting; will be approved at next meeting.

Council member comment on items not listed on the agenda:

- Pip: trying to increase community engagement; sending out a mailer for (s)election this fall, feedback from a survey to be posted in meeting and Facebook
- Naomi: Shawn Chernila to represent area 1 for Analy/West County school board, local voice
- Tony: when are we doing in person meetings?
 - Pip: D5 input?
 - Lynda: A decision for the MAC; hybrid option available with OWL device
 - Tony likes the hybrid idea, good for community involvement
- Lisa: MAC outreach via farmers market MAC table with Vesta and Lucy
- Vesta: Fire safe Forestville at farmer's market; fire safe Sonoma doing well; measure D for funding at Forestville school in November
- Nic: Has to strike Guerneville booth at market, will leave early; booth also at Rocking the River; town hall meeting in Guerneville as model for next MAC (outdoors, good location)
- Tony: Rocking the River GMRS radio booth, taking off, deploying repeaters and talking in neighborhoods

Public comment on matters not listed on the agenda: n/a

Regular Calendar Items:

Lynda Hopkins Update

- New field rep Tracy Lyons out in Forestville
- Vacation Rentals- lots of misinformation in the community
 - BOS set up a framework for decisions to come...
 - Banned vacation rentals in R1; some historic properties are zoned R1, others serve as workforce housing not in R, toothpaste tube effect concern
 - Exclusion and inclusion process; working very closely with River communities to determine where lines are drawn
 - Can do exclusion zone not in R1, 5% cap, 10% cap, inclusion zones in R1 (20%, 25%) with other areas for workforce housing
 - Switching from permit process to business license for vacation rentals
 - Can revoke easier, more requirements on operations. Sent back for more revisions on nuisance type issues
 - Increasing fines for offenses; some are slaps on wrist, more variance in fines needed
- Leo: District 5 staff met with Brian Oh and emphasized that Permit Sonoma needs to engage in community-based, thorough process for nuanced policy
- Council questions:
 - Naomi: Is there data for those getting fined/repeat offenders, who has permits vs not?
 - Lynda: County has been really bad at code enforcement, money not properly utilized despite being allocated, not many fines issued.
 - Naomi: This could prove a point for companies who are doing their work and improving facilities.
 - Alice: Question answered there
 - Nic: As he understands it, the only way to file a complaint is with TOT or if it is advertised online. People have started being private since the moratorium.
 - Lynda: True. There are very few, unusual instances when they can be caught in real-time. Most illegal rentals are found via online scraping.
 - Nic: Point of failure in the system. There needs to be a way to make a complaint and be verified aside from online listing.
 - Leo: Working on 24/7 hotline, new contractor for this kind of work. This will create a singular place for people in unincorporated Sonoma County to submit complaints and hopefully get code enforcement to act. Hotline ready by labor day weekend for the community.
 - Vesta: Link to last BOS meeting for the vacation rental ordinance ruling. Parking is a huge issue; it would be great to get bullet points for clarity on changes and the timing of changes in the ordinance.
 - Lynda: Ordinance has not been adopted, to come back to BOS before the final note. No permits are advancing until the vote. Rezoning in January, moratorium until then.
 - Vesta: Which permits are in the pipeline versus not?
 - Lynda: Grace period for filers in the pipeline to be processed due to threat of a lawsuit.
 - Naomi: In regard to Nic's concerns. As she understands, when rentals are honest about TOT, is there a tracking system in the TOT tracking the location of where the funds are coming from? It seems like money comes in from TOT than the county has permits issued for.
 - Lynda: County has a bad contract with companies and county, resulting in lack of clear tracking system. It comes in as a lump sum, most of it probably coming in from 5th District, but we cannot claim our fair share.

- Leo: Stories of people paying TOT but expressing frustration about not knowing about the permitting process. Constituents caught in scrapes.
- Public Questions:
 - Kristin: How long is the ban? Where is the map Lynda is referencing?
 - Lynda: Moratorium goes through May of 2023 and could be extended, or until the ordinance is adopted.
 - Leo: Affirmed date. It can legally be extended another year, but nobody wants to see that happen. The first attachment in the meeting link has key summary and bullet points.
 - Eric Fraser: truthintourism@gmail.com // Sad about the conversation on tourism. Misrepresentations in the board presentation. STR permit occupancies range from 0 to 70%, with an average of 30%, and many properties are not caught in scrapes. No appeal x zone process, x zones do not work. There should be more activity enforcement. No noise ordinance, but vacation rentals have a right to visit properties on California waterways.
 - Lynda: Stands by her statements as to what transpired at the BOS meeting. Zoning is not consistent, we need to create a fabric that works for the lower Russian River. It will take compromise.
 - Tia Resleure: Are the plus 2 and plus 6 visitors going to be figured into parking and septic allowances?
 - Lynda: County Council walked through what is allowed in pre-existing rentals. They will be subject to new business license requirements, such as noise and light standards, but will not be subject to other requirements about parking and occupant numbers. New permits will not be given these additions. There will be grandfathering of existing permits.
 - Hani: How are K zone properties being treated under new regulations?
 - Lynda: K properties are visitor serving in the Supervisor's opinion since they are public serving. Gave direction that K zoned properties should not be negatively affected. Cazadero Inn somehow got a fine for rentals. K and LC zoned properties need to be treated differently.
 - Tia Resleure: Can we get enforcement when roads are blocked?
 - Lynda: CHP contract should provide more responsiveness.
 - Elise: Labor Day to Memorial Day increased contracting. If the driveway or road is entirely blocked, CHP or 911 will take care of it, since it is an emergency situation. We are seeing 90 more parking tickets a year due to increased CHP presence, though we do not get the money generated. Residents were ticketed as well, but CHP can't distinguish.
 - Robin Finkelstein: What if an emergency vehicle couldn't get through?
 - Elise: You can call 911 if it is too tight for you to get through.
 - Leo: We can communicate areas that are regularly illegally parked on to CHP and TPW. The county is trying to improve SOCO Connect for reporting problems.
 - Hani: If applications were submitted before May 10th, how long will it take to be processed?
 - Leo: Process with Permit Sonoma tends to be lengthy, but they claim to be caught up so it will hopefully be the near future.
 - Lynda: District 5 office can help with trouble shooting. Reach out if a planner or someone has dropped the ball.

Pavement Preservation Program- Overview and Update

- Pip: Road count is often important for the paving process. Unincorporated areas are disadvantaged.
- Elise: There have been decades of underfunding West County roads due to even split of funds, despite West County having 40% of county roads. Since Lynda, road funding matches road

mileage. Slow process due to catching up. TPW says that we have repaved 20% of West County Road. Road Ad-Hoc from MAC helped get roads in 22-23. For 24-25, we need the MAC to look at the roads we believe to be most important for priority roads. Pavement preservation program means that roads are repaved as they are; they do not put in bike lanes or other additions because it triggers permits and environmental review. District 5 wants to put in more sidewalks and bike lanes. Bike lanes need to be put back. A form will go to the Roads Ad-Hoc to get a list of roads. There is a list of roads being worked on in the TPW.

- Council questions:
 - Vesta: Wants a center turn lane across from Steelhead beach. The land across from Steelhead just went on the market and hopes that the county would purchase it to make the center turn lane.
 - Elise: Widening the lane creates a 3-4 year process. It is not covered by the Pavement Preservation Program.
 - Vesta: It is at the Trenton Road and River Road lot directly across from Steelhead beach. It is a creek that goes into the River, so it would be good to have because of its environmental sensitivity.
 - Elise: They will walk out there to look at signage issues and make sure they're on the same page.
- Public Questions
 - John Uniak: Major problem for 25 years in Rio Nido that the County needs to take care of. Large vehicles ran over roads after landslides on various roads. Directed to submit to Ad Hoc.
 - Marsee: Been in Rio Nido for 20 years and has seen maybe 3 roads paved in that time. Even after dealing with fires and trucks, the roads have not been repaired. Especially bad on Canyon 1 where she lives. Potholes filled without prep-work.
 - Elise: The county has replaced culverts and retaining walls in the area. Please bring the specific roads to your representatives so we can get to work on them.
 - Pip: Please direct your road complaints to the Ad Hoc.
 - Leslie Latham: She would love to help out with the Road Ad Hoc, has energy and experience.
 - David Rosen: Many in Rio Nido grateful for the Ad Hoc, and are ready to help!
 - Hani: Willow and Canyon 7 are very bad and in need of repair. Huge puddles of water sitting there, and a school bus stop. Dirt shortcut by the intersection that adds to the issue.
 - Directed to contact Ad Hoc/Pip

Create Roads AdHoc to develop mechanism and process to submit roads for consideration in the Pavement Preservation Program

- Pip: Creating an Ad Hoc. The Ad Hoc will reach out to each council member to relay feedback from constituents. A spreadsheet/form will be created so that there is a consistent place for feedback. He will be on the Ad Hoc.
 - **Vesta, Lisa join; Pip calls for Motion to approve Ad Hoc**
 - **Motion by Alice, second by Nic; role call vote motion passes unanimously**
- Lynda: \$2 million for infrastructure in the district. If it doesn't fit into the pavement box, the district has flexible funding to make community improvements, such as culvert and drainage work.

Amendment to bylaws to eliminate term limits

- Pip: We do not want to limit the number of involvement by our current representatives. There was general consensus at the last meeting to dissolve term limits.
 - Elise: there will be a significant push in the coming months to increase participation and get new people involved. Pocket Canyon area has not given us a representative. We want to make the MAC more effective and expand it along with taking away term limits.
- Council Comment:
 - Vesta: Pocket Canyon issue. The MAC table at the farmer's market and potential hybrid meetings could expand the audience.
 - Elise: Representatives do amazing stuff in between meetings! At "friends of" meetings, chat with constituents, and enjoy being able to help their neighborhoods in this way.
- Public Comment: John Uniack: This organization was formed as an elected group, the same as the redevelopment oversight committee. Believes this turned into an appointed group. Does not agree that this should be an appointed group. Suggests that they do not take term limits off, because it will turn bureaucratic and new ideas will not come in.
 - Elise: The MAC is an advisory committee to the Supervisor. First iterations of the MAC, there were multiple representative applications, so elections were held. Elections are held when there are multiple people.
 - **Nic Pereira leaves 6:55**
 - Pip: We were never really elected because of legal implications with the county. Hopkins liked the idea of elections to get community feedback on who the preferred candidate is. Results have always been used by Lynda, but Hopkins technically selects the representative.
 - Lynda: Affirms Pip's statement. "Selection" not "election" process.
- Eric Fraser: The council is presented to the public in a very manipulative way. Subject matter experts are not comfortable coming forward. There is a purposeful use of information and propaganda. Some processes benefit the county but do not create value, such as rent-seeking.
 - Naomi: Not looking at changing bylaws to lessen volunteer time, rather giving an open window to represent areas even when nobody now wants to step up. If anyone wants to volunteer, that's all they have to do.
- Marsee: Having been involved with a local community group, it is very hard to get people to step up and spend the hours to get stuff done.
- John Uniack: Let Ad Hoc Committee have community members. - They can
 - Pip: Agrees that new blood is great.
- Pip: **Motion to approve the change in the bylaw?**
 - **Motion by Vesta, Kyra second; motion passes unanimously, Nic Pereria not present**

Committee/Staff/Council member reports

AdHoc Reports:

- Lisa, Trash Ad Hoc
 - The trash talk group was reinvigorated by Alice and more volunteers. Lucy Hardcastle on the committee. It is about the river and community clean-ups. Brandon Heart with the county-provided information, Lucy will do a clean-up in Forestville. There are many forms to fill out, we will metabolize them. Carol at Russian Riverkeeper is involved. We were all invited to get into canoes on the River and pick up trash. Thanks to chair Pip, community clean-ups will involve e-waste, hazmat, and beyond. Adopt a Road forms; walk around to local businesses as representatives. Clyde Galentine from the county is keen to get people to sign up- it is free advertising! Always looking for volunteers. SOCO Connect app has been working.

- Vesta: The major issue is “for free” items, often end up in homeless camps with hoarding. The cleanup crews haul it away and costs a lot of money. People need to be conscious of that; the county has programs to help take that stuff away.
 - Public Comment:
 - Eric Fraser: Opposes non-resident property owners being purposefully excluded from the MACs.
- Vesta: Thank you to people who participated on the vacation rental committee.

Staff Reports:

- Elise:
 - TPW worked to do vegetation management during the Spring. Vegetation management requests will be taken care of when fire danger is lower.
 - The Russian River Confluence’s Respect Russian River merchandise for the community to unite everyone around respecting the river. The product line will be provided to business partners who agree to move toward sustainable industry and engage the community and the logo will be available for local artists to play with, launching on the 29th of September. Close to 20 different organizations ready to sign on to the Confluence.
 - Lisa: What great outreach! Glad that tribes are on board.
 - Pip: It could make a big impact in the River. Likes the short line for the campaign.
 - Vesta: URLs? Will be live in coming weeks?
 - Yes- russianriverconfluence.org is old and will be populated with new site, and respectrussianriver.org
 - Strategic plan for the Lower Russian River; four proposals for a governance study and interviews held. Will be in the contracting process in the next month. The aims are local services, resources, and tax revenue. Roads, for example. As Herman Hernandez says, everyone needs a check-up! Is there a way to improve efficiencies? Over 40 community service districts in the area.
 - Naomi: Is it like a report?
 - Elise: It will look at functions like an audit.
 - Tony: I appreciate movement on this. Roads not repaired, schools closing, families leaving, Air BnB movement, rapid changes.
- Leo: Lower Russian River Waster Water Advisory meeting Thursday the 25th, a draft of wastewater treatment policy. Hopkins and Rabbitt will be at the meeting to hear their feedback.
 - Kyra: Thank you, as a member who sits on the KAG. Please make a Facebook post.
 - Elise: send those agendas to me!

Kyra motions to adjourn, second by Alice; motion passes unanimously, Pip absent 7:33



**Lower Russian River Municipal Advisory Council
Trash Ad-Hoc Committee
2022 October Report**

Members: Lisa Nahmanson (Chair: Forestville); Alice Teeter (Hacienda); Lucy Hardcastle (Forestville Alternate); Carol Shumate (Volunteer: Russian Riverkeeper); Vicki Clewes (Volunteer: Hacienda)

Objective: Work with amazing staff (Debbie and Elise) at District 5 to connect community clean-up efforts with available resources and ideas to address trash challenges. Please get in touch if you would like to join our effort. Next meeting is October 2. Don't hesitate to get in touch at Lisa.Rivermac@gmail.com

Result: We reinvigorated our group this summer, meeting on July 28th, September 1st, and September 29th and have focused on 1) collaboration with the non-profit Russian Riverkeeper 2) building a template for community clean-up days and 3) creating a comprehensive one page FAQ to hand out at community events and post on social which directs folk to the appropriate organization or facility for dumping trash.

Russian Riverkeeper:

- Carol Shumate is the Clean Team Director for Russian Riverkeeper and brings a wealth of knowledge to our group. Carol can be reached at carol@russianriverkeeper.org
- Carol started tackling trash as a volunteer in 2015 before joining as the clean camp coordinator in 2018 and becoming Director in 2021.
- Carol has provided our group with an abundance of information about the 3 trash hot spots that the Clean Team focuses on: helping the unhoused population, disaster response to fires and flood, and coordinating volunteers.

Forestville Community Clean Up: (aka "Dump Day")

- The Forestville Planning Association (FPA) is the sponsoring agency. Lucy Hardcastle (President) and Kelly Joyce (Board member) and volunteers will be facilitating the Clean Up on October 14th for the 95436 zip code.
- We will publish a comprehensive "how to" document by the end of year December meeting that lays out step by step the process of organizing and enacting a Community Clean Up Day in your neighborhood.
- Pulling these events together includes special thank yous to collaborating agencies County TPW (Brandon Hart, Engineering Tech II) and Zero Waste Sonoma/Recology (Meilin Tsao, Zero Waste Specialist) and a shout out to Friends of Rio Nido for their help with last minute fine tuning (Marsee Henon and Ingrid Emming).

Lower Russian River MAC Vacation Rental Locations

Yellow dots show rentals with 200-foot buffer

